

Discussion of  
“A Comparison of Academic Ranking Scales”  
by Alona Zharova, Andrija Mihoci, and Wolfgang Karl Hrdle

Steffen Ahrens  
Technische Universität Berlin

CRC 649 Conference  
Motzen, 17 July 2015

- Q1: How to predict a rank for non-included researchers
- Q2: What is the relationship between HB, RP, and GS?
- Q3: How does age influence academic rankings?

# Main Results

- Q1: How to predict a rank for non-included researchers
- R1: Regression models successfully interpolate missing rankings.
- Q2: What is the relationship between HB, RP, and GS?
- R2: Relatively weak linear relationship between HB, RP, and GS ranks.
- Q3: How does age influence academic rankings?
- R3: Most influential factor determining the rank.

- Develops methods for completing missing researcher profiles in rankings
- Sheds light on the relationship among rankings with highly different ranking procedures
- Develops methods for improving the usage of the information from rankings
- (Might) lead to development of more informative “ranking index”

# Discussion 1

- Concerning research question 1
  - Interest in filling gaps or having a final total score?
  - Regression model and significance levels?
- Concerning research question 2
  - What about citation based vs. non-citation based rankings?
- Concerning research question 3
  - Many citations from few papers vs many from many papers  
(papers on aggregation, nominal rigidities, monopolistic competition)
  - Does age still have an influence, if discounted measures are used?

- General comments on academic rankings
  - Academia = establishment engaged in higher education and research! Does teaching find any consideration in the ranking?
  - Are researchers outside of academic institutions (such as research institutes, research department in banks and central banks) considered?
  - Do rankings consider (and weigh) citations from other fields? (General relevance of the research topic)
  - Do rankings account for the contribution of each researcher for the single citation?
  - Do rankings account for socially relevant questions? (Who is the BEST economist? Science vs. applied vs. policy work!)